

# Faculty Senate

Minutes

September 13, 2022



MICHIGAN STATE  
UNIVERSITY

## Approval of Agenda and Minutes

The Michigan State University Faculty Senate held a special meeting on Tuesday, September 13, 2022 at 7:00 p.m. via Zoom with Chairperson Karen Kelly-Blake presiding. The agenda was approved as presented. The chairperson gave a brief overview of expectations for the meeting.

## Remarks

### President Samuel L. Stanley Jr.

President Stanley gave the following remarks:

Thank you so much, Chairwoman Kelly-Blake. I'm really glad to be with everybody tonight and, actually, glad to be here in general. I want to thank everyone for their messages of support and encouragement and to those who've spoken publicly supporting the provost and me.

There's so many things swirling around right now, news stories hourly, and it could be easy to lose track of the core issues. And, in this moment of uncertainty, my number one priority remains the health and safety of our community and fostering a culture of accountability.

That really arose from my first few weeks at Michigan State University, when I received the Office of Civil Rights Department of Education summary report on the university's response to the Nassar and Strampel cases. The summary stated that a fundamental failure of the institution and its most senior leadership had been failure to report and failure to act on reports of sexual misconduct and relationship violence. The report identified individuals who had failed to report and called upon me to take action — and I did. I did that as our first steps together in changing the culture at MSU to one of responsibility and accountability.

But culture change is difficult, so it's not completely a surprise that the provost's decision to hold the of the College of Business accountable for failures of leadership related to Title IX was controversial with some members of campus.

But I was very surprised when the Board announced it was hiring outside legal counsel to review this decision. As I said publicly then and reiterate here, that Dr. Gupta served in his role as dean at the will of the provost, and she was well within her rights to make this leadership transition. I fully support this decision and the process utilized to come to this action.

So, I appreciate your efforts to maintain clear and distinct lines of responsibility for personnel decisions at MSU, making sure that the administration, faculty and staff maintain their autonomy in making these decisions — and making sure our Title IX process and outcomes for any individual case is not subject to Board of Trustees appeal. As Barbara Snyder of the AAU said eloquently yesterday, "micromanagement and partisan politics have no place on a healthy university board."

And before I conclude, I did want to mention one thing that I think is important, and this is related to news stories that are out there, and I just wanted to give you one statement quickly if I can. This involves the certification process that's required by Michigan state for



public universities to certify that one member of the board and the president have reviewed all cases that involve Title IX with faculty and staff and if it comes to a decision and a hearing.

I faithfully complied with this Michigan certification process the last two years and reviewed all the Title IX reports that were required. Contrary to information previously provided to me, in June of this year — this June, 2022 — I was notified that some of our board members may not have actually complied with their part of the state requirement in 2021. We asked for an internal audit and a review of the situation, which raised questions about our compliance and made it clear we can improve the processes by which the reviews were taking place. An external counsel, an external consultant, is now helping improve the processes and keep us in compliance. We have been taking this issue very seriously.

So, I want to thank you again for joining tonight. Thank you for your efforts to understand these very complex things, but particularly, thank you for your commitment to make sure that shared governance continues to work as it should work.

Last year, I think, was a watershed opportunity for us to work together as an administration and shared governance. I think we got many things accomplished for the betterment of the university and I appreciate those efforts. We need to maintain the important distinctions that the chairperson mentioned earlier and make sure that we're not falling into a situation where politics and other considerations interfere with our academic mission.

So, thank you again, and I'll close there.

#### Provost Teresa K. Woodruff

Provost Woodruff gave the following remarks:

Thank you, Faculty Senate Chairperson Kelly-Blake. I appreciate your invitation to this special meeting of the Faculty Senate. I want to frame my remarks this evening with the backdrop of our values statement: Michigan State University is committed to providing an environment that fosters the values of mutual respect, dignity, responsibility, and open communication. As Provost, it is my responsibility to live by these commitments and take actions that align with this promise. Together we have committed to creating a safer, more secure, and more supportive university community by taking deliberate and meaningful action when our values are at risk. In my remarks, I will discuss the resignation of the business school dean from leadership, and answer two questions: Did we have a deliberative process? Did we act in the faithful execution of the university values?

As faculty and administrative leadership, we share a collective responsibility and commitment to this institution. As members of the Faculty Senate, you have a special role in achieving the mission of our university. During my time as Provost, we have worked collaboratively on a number of initiatives, including the revocation of Emeritum Status and the Discipline and Dismissal of Tenured Faculty for Cause policy. This work, done in partnership, is important for me to summarize as it relates to the context of the case surrounding Dr. Gupta, which I will touch upon in a moment.



Together, the Council of Deans, Faculty Senate and Board of Trustees, unanimously agreed and implemented the work of the RVSM taskforce to do four things:

- 1) Transparency and Communications Guidelines for Employee Misconduct Cases;
- 2) Revised Discipline and Dismissal of Tenured Faculty for Cause Policy;
- 3) Training for academic administrators and academic governance to increase knowledge and create consistency;
- 4) Creation of a Standing Dismissal Hearing Panel.

I come before you to provide that transparency, to the extent that I am permitted, while respecting the integrity of our policies and processes.

As the president affirms and Board of Trustees has acknowledged, personnel matters pertaining to deans are the purview of the provost. When I receive a report from an investigatory body such as the Office of Institutional Equity (OIE) on my direct report, it is my responsibility to evaluate and take appropriate action, including hearing from the individual involved in the case. This latter diligence is necessary to ensure a first-hand accounting of the mitigating or motivating circumstances of the case. It is imperative that I have the full confidence in my leadership team who are themselves responsible for the lives and pursuits of our faculty and academic staff, support staff and most critically, our student body. When findings in an investigative OIE case and a leadership management review report are presented to me, I have the duty to ensure that all our decisions align with university policies and expectations, and I have the duty to act.

Dr. Gupta failed in his mandatory reporting responsibility. Additionally, he failed to act in a timely and reasonable manner to protect students and uphold our values. The culture that we seek is one in which the wellbeing and safety of everyone is managed in an immediate, cooperative and trauma-informed way.

In the meeting with myself and the Interim Associate Provost and Associate Vice President for Faculty and Academic Staff Affairs, Dr. Gupta acknowledged his awareness of the actions that occurred and what he should have done. After this interchange I accepted the verbal resignation of Dr. Gupta, who shook my hand and thanked me for the comportment of the process. Shortly thereafter he then sent an email to the Broad College of Business indicating his resignation.

I informed the Board of Trustees of Dr. Gupta's resignation and the precipitating events. The university policies and procedures were all duly followed. The work was deliberative and neither capricious nor malicious. I stand by this course of action today.

There have been counter narratives propagated that I will not address, for those matters that swirl beyond the truth and reason have no standing. That said, I do understand the reasons for the stories that have been told or tweeted for they are part of a human response that says, this can't be true about my friend, my colleague, my leaders. And this is what makes the work so difficult.

MSU has many survivors – courageous survivors. I hear the voices of those who do not have defenders in their networks – those who have been demeaned, touched, made to feel

# Faculty Senate

Minutes

September 13, 2022



MICHIGAN STATE  
UNIVERSITY

an object, removed of their dignity and a moment of celebration, and subjected to the haunting worries of identity and worth. Did we have deliberative process? Did we act in the faithful execution of the university values? Yes, and yes again.

Our culture of support encourages us to: Know more. Do more. Support more. Our clarion call is to protect students and the campus community. And build a safer, more responsive campus. And with our president, I am ready to continue this work with you.

## Executive Vice President for Health Sciences Norman J. Beauchamp Jr.

EVPHS Beauchamp gave the following remarks:

Thank you very much for the chance to address. You know, I've reflected a great deal on what I can lend to this conversation, and I've decided it's to be a steward of hope. I, similar to you, have had moments of disbelief, disappointment, and fear. Fear because there's an anger and an escalation that is far too reminiscent of a past that we committed to learn from. It was a commitment we made so that never again—never again—would we risk injuring those that came to us in trust or those that serve our institution.

So my ask is only that we say "no." No to being dragged backwards, no to anger, no to escalation, but simply "yes" to holding each other accountable to our values. A culture that's transparent, open, trusting, and safe; to cultivating leadership that is caring and accountable; and a commitment that all will be able to engage in a community that's inclusive and equitable. Those are the values we committed to, and that is the foundation that must give us hope.

It is my observation that our provost and our president have committed to living those values and have led by those values. I think most difficult is we also committed to no "we/they." No "we/they." And these moments can be polarizing. I think we have to come together with the urgency that's needed to solve this challenge that faces us, lest there be no understanding and no opportunity to solve and people being injured.

So I am girded by the fact that we have a strong foundation based in our values, and I believe in coming together and remembering that this moment cannot define us. We will move forward. Thank you.

## Faculty Senate Chairperson Karen Kelly-Blake

Chairperson Karen Kelly-Blake gave the following remarks:

Recent events have destabilized our university. As the faculty, we will not get caught up in the noise. Academic governance is a verb. It is the work we do. Our work is important. It is vital and necessary. Our work aligns with our institutional processes and institutional values. Let us do this work.

The chairperson granted speaking rights to the trustees attending the meeting (Trustees Rema Vassar and Renee Knake Jefferson) without objection.

By consent, Chairperson Kelly-Blake established a special rule of order limiting all comments to three minutes each.



## Resolution Encouraging Transparency from the Board of Trustees

Senator Danielle DeVoss moved to adopt a resolution that, after amendment, read:

*Whereas*, There is a lack of transparency and shared communication around the current situation related to the Board of Trustees supposedly demanding President Samuel Stanley’s resignation; therefore be it,

*Resolved*, That Faculty Senate strongly discourages and is opposed to the Board of Trustees firing, demanding the resignation of, or retirement of President Samuel Stanley until more information is provided to the university community; further, be it

*Resolved*, That an investigation into the actions of the Board of Trustees be conducted by the Office of Audit, Risk, and Compliance and a report with recommendations for action be provided to the Trustee Committee on Audit, Risk and Compliance and presented to the Faculty Senate and University Council to discuss prior to the October 28 Board of Trustees meeting.

Discussion revolved around calls for various degrees of transparency from the university, how much information would be appropriate for public release, and whether the Board’s hiring of outside counsel to review a personnel matter involving a dean was a *de facto* overreach. Following debate and amendment, the resolution was adopted by a vote of 49 to 3.

## Resolution Expressing No Confidence in the Board Amended to Call for Board of Trustees to Undergo Professional Development

University Committee on Academic Governance Chairperson Jack Lipton moved to adopt a resolution reading:

*Whereas*, The Code of Ethics for the Trustees of Michigan State University state that they will “properly elect, support, and evaluate the President; and avoid involvement in administrative matters not subject to the direct authority of the Board” and that they will “support open communication, transparency, and the free expression of ideas and will not condone any form of deceit, incivility, intimidation, silencing, or retaliation”; and,

*Whereas*, Recent actions of the Board of Trustees—including inappropriate involvement in academic management, unbecoming statements to the press, and a general lack of transparency—violate best practices for good governance;<sup>1</sup> therefore be it,

*Resolved*, That the Faculty Senate has lost confidence in the Board of Trustees and believes its members should resign.

Significant debate occurred regarding several aspects of the resolution, including whether senators had enough information to fairly vote no confidence and whether any call for resignation should be limited to particular members of the Board of Trustees.

---

<sup>1</sup> Citations omitted.

# Faculty Senate

Minutes

September 13, 2022



MICHIGAN STATE  
UNIVERSITY

Vice Chairperson Stephanie Anthony moved to amend the “resolved” clause such that the amended motion would read:

*Whereas*, The Code of Ethics for the Trustees of Michigan State University state that they will “properly elect, support, and evaluate the President; and avoid involvement in administrative matters not subject to the direct authority of the Board” and that they will “support open communication, transparency, and the free expression of ideas and will not condone any form of deceit, incivility, intimidation, silencing, or retaliation”; and,

*Whereas*, Recent actions of the Board of Trustees—including inappropriate involvement in academic management, unbecoming statements to the press, and a general lack of transparency—violate best practices for good governance;<sup>2</sup> therefore be it,

*Resolved*, The Faculty Senate has been disappointed with the lack of transparency and prior actions noted. In order to maintain full confidence in its Board of Trustees, and in the spirit of working together as Spartans will and can to uphold the success of the entire MSU community, the Faculty Senate requests that the Board of Trustees hire a professional governance firm within the next 60 days and undergo professional development, which shall include the President of the University.

The motion to replace the “resolved” clause was adopted after debate by a vote of 31 to 15. Following additional discussion, the amended resolution was adopted by a vote of 40 to 14.

## Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 8:34 p.m.

Tyler Silvestri

Secretary for Academic Governance

**Approved:** September 20, 2022

---

<sup>2</sup> The same citations are omitted.

# Faculty Senate

Minutes

September 13, 2022



**MICHIGAN STATE**  
UNIVERSITY

Attendance	
<b>Present</b>	62
<b>Absent</b>	8
<b>Total</b>	70
<b>Quorum</b>	36

Constituency/Title	Name	Attendance
Academic Specialists	Megan Stevenson	Absent
Agriculture and Natural Resources	Cimberly Weir	Present
Agriculture and Natural Resources	Lorraine Weatherspoon	Present
Agriculture and Natural Resources	Satish Joshi	Present
Agriculture and Natural Resources	Sinem Mollaoglu	Present
Agriculture and Natural Resources	Dale Rozeboom	Absent
Arts and Letters	Brahim Chakrani	Present
Arts and Letters	Danielle DeVoss	Present
Arts and Letters	Karthik Durvasula	Present
Arts and Letters	Kate Birdsall	Present
Arts and Letters	Yore Kedman	Present
At Large	d'Ann de Simone	Present
At Large	Megan Donahue	Present
At Large	Rebecca Malouin	Present
At Large, Chairperson	Karen Kelly-Blake	Present
At Large, Vice Chairperson	Stephanie Anthony	Present
Business	Quan Zhang	Substituted: Shawnee Vickery
Business	Ayalla Ruvio	Present
Business	John Spink	Present
Communication Arts and Sciences	Dan Hiaeshutter-Rice	Present
Communication Arts and Sciences	Rabindra "Robby" Ratan	Present
Communication Arts and Sciences	Lucinda Davenport	Absent
Education	Amelia Gotwals	Present
Education	Emre Umucu	Present



# Faculty Senate

Minutes

September 13, 2022



**MICHIGAN STATE**  
UNIVERSITY

Constituency/Title	Name	Attendance
Education	Matthew Brodhead	Present
Emeriti Faculty	Gary Stone	Present
Engineering	Chengcheng Fang	Present
Engineering	Mark Worden	Present
Engineering	Neil Wright	Present
Engineering	Wei Liao	Present
FRIB	Chris Wrede	Present
Human Medicine	Amber Heard-Booth	Present
Human Medicine	Cristian Meghea	Present
Human Medicine	Hua Xiao	Present
Human Medicine	Michael Williams	Present
Human Medicine	Scott Counts	Present
James Madison	Daniel Ahlquist	Present
James Madison	Jennifer Goett	Present
Law	Jennifer Carter-Johnson	Present
Law	Wenona Singel	Present
Libraries	Lisa Robinson	Present
Libraries	Rick Stoddart	Present
Libraries	Alexandra Hauser	Absent
Lyman Briggs	Samantha Cass	Present
Lyman Briggs	Richard Bellon	Absent
Music	Guy Yehuda	Present
Music	Sarah Long	Absent
Natural Science	Aaron Odom	Present
Natural Science	Francois Greer	Present
Natural Science	Min-Hao Kuo	Present
Natural Science	Thomas Hamann	Present
Nursing	Gayle Lourens	Present
Osteopathic Medicine	Erik Shapiro	Present
Osteopathic Medicine	Jacek Cholewicki	Present



# Faculty Senate

Minutes

September 13, 2022



**MICHIGAN STATE**  
UNIVERSITY

Constituency/Title	Name	Attendance
Osteopathic Medicine	Jason Bazil	Present
Osteopathic Medicine	Kin Sing Lee	Present
RCAH	Eric Aronoff	Present
RCAH	India Plough	Present
Social Science	Laurie Bullock	Present
Social Science	Peilei Fan	Present
Social Science	Pilar Horner	Present
Social Science	Raymond Jussaume	Present
UCAG	Jack Lipton	Present
UCC	Alison Dobbins	Present
UCFA	Jamie Alan	Present
UCFT	Susan Barman	Present
UCGS	Gary Hoppenstand	Absent
UCUE	Antoinette Tessmer	Present
Veterinary Medicine	Sean Crosson	Present
Veterinary Medicine	Stephan Carey	Absent