Approval of Agenda and Minutes

The Michigan State University Faculty Senate held a regular meeting on Tuesday, October 11, 2022 at 3:15 p.m. via Zoom with Chairperson Karen Kelly-Blake presiding. The agenda was approved as presented. The draft minutes of the September 20, 2022 meeting were approved as presented.

Remarks

President Samuel L. Stanley Jr.

President Stanley gave the following remarks:

Well thank you, Chairperson Kelly-Blake. And good afternoon, everyone. I'm glad to be here with you and join you all. It's a beautiful day in East Lansing. It would be nice if we could hold this meeting outside, but we'll do what we need to do.

As many of you are already aware, last week I sent a letter to Chairperson Byrum of the Board of Trustees to express concern over the manner in which the board is handling their external review of Dr. Gupta's personnel matter. In that letter, I reminded the board of the importance of the university's non-retaliation policy and also stressed the need for the existing OIE [Office of Institutional Equity] investigation to not be influenced or impacted. Additionally, I stated that employees should not feel pressured or intimidated for fear of retaliation from the board as part of this review process. But I still don't believe this external review is necessarily needed.

The administration is cooperating with the law firm by providing the requested materials. But I also felt it's my duty to ensure that employees are protected from undue pressure; so, I told the board that MSU employees will not be compelled to participate in Quinn Emanuel's external review. And if they choose to participate, the university will offer legal counsel to them.

Now importantly—in contrary to some recent reports—we've made great progress to improve our campus culture and RVSM [Relationship Violence & Sexual Misconduct] prevention over the last three years. I provided a progress update during the last board meeting, and those remarks can be found on my website. Today, I would like to reinforce four points for the group. First, we've made great progress addressing the more than 150 new requirements asked of Michigan State University by three different federal agencies upon my arrival. The Title IX office, in coordination with the provost's office, health sciences, human resources, FASA, the general counsel, audit risk and compliance, and with the advice and guidance of Rebecca Campbell and Andrea Munford has met every one of those requirements to date. Some requirements are set to begin at a later date. You can track our progress on our commitment website by clicking "Track Our Progress" at [msu.edu/ourcommitment](https://msu.edu/ourcommitment). Second, the work of the Title IX office has been validated by a third-party reviewer with expertise in Title IX, the law firm Cozen O'Connor--We've been utilizing over the past three years. While the cost has been significant, they've really been worth every penny in helping us independently track our progress. Importantly—and most importantly—they have consistently found that our Title IX policies and procedures are both appropriately aligned with the law and appropriately applied. Also indicated was that the Title IX office investigations are, and I quote, "fair, impartial, and thorough." At the same time, Cozen O'Connor has provided other helpful suggestions for ways to improve--Which we have diligently been reviewing and implementing after receiving each of their reports.

And I do have some concerns that the board hiring an additional firm to evaluate our Title IX efforts is duplicative of the work we've been already proactively doing alongside Cozen O'Connor for the past three years. I would certainly admit we have more work to do, but it is important we recognize our progress and give thanks to all the hardworking Spartans moving us forward in this space. The third point I want to make is [that] we're putting resources towards increasing staffing levels in the Title IX process. We know there are concerns about timeliness in our processes, so to improve things, we've increased our Title IX office from sixteen members in 2018 to 41 today. This summer, we also added a dedicated person focused solely on intake of cases, freeing up investigators to focus on investigations. And we've just authorized six new hires in the Office of Civil Rights, including adding a case manager, bringing our total case managers to three.

These are crucial positions to move cases forward in a timely manner through all steps of the process. And once again, it allows investigators to focus solely on investigative procedures while others take on the logistical steps. We've also added an equity coordinator position, which will support individuals involved in Title IX processes during the interim steps prior to investigations being complete. We're adding four more investigators. As I said before, we know from third party reviewer Cozen O'Connor that our investigations are thorough and impartial. And we never want to sacrifice that thoroughness for the sake of speed. So to that end, we need more investigators to handle the bottom of cases we have. As you will hear from Becky and Andrea later, Michigan State University's higher number of reports don't mean that we have more incidents than our peer institutions. In fact, across the nation, we know incidents are under reported. And at Michigan State University, however, people have been educated and know where to go to file a report thanks to our strong reporting requirements. And that in turn generates a higher volume of reports than in peer institutions. Dr. Campbell will explain this in more depth—drawn on research she and colleagues have conducted nationally.

Leadership is key in this realm; we've launched the search for the vice president of civil rights and Title IX education and compliance. We've elevated this role to a vice presidential position given its importance. That search will be co-chaired by Jabbar Bennett and Andrea Munford. And our goal is to complete the search by early spring of 2023. Fourth and last, we've continued to explore better ways to address the high number of reports in cases that need to be investigated in Michigan State University. Voting on our internal review and a review by Cozen O'Connor, the university has contracted the data consulting group ECG to conduct a comprehensive review to help improve OCR and OIE processes and evaluate current staffing levels.

ECG has a well-established track record in what is commonly referred to as the Six Sigma methodology, which draws on process engineering and supply chain research. Six Sigma is widely used in business industry and healthcare settings to improve work task processes. ECG is committed to working with Title IX and other subject matter experts to ensure they're recommending process improvements that adhere to laws, regulations, and MSU specific requirements. Now, again, Lieutenant Munford and Professor Campbell will go into more detail about our RVSM prevention and culture change efforts. And I know we still have much work to do there. But I just want to reiterate, we're making real progress. Addressing, as I said, more than 150 additional federal requirements, ensuring investigations are fair, impartial, and thorough, adding staff and resources, and continuously exploring new ways to do better.

And all of this progress is thanks to the many staff, faculty, and leaders who are working so hard to foster a safe and inclusive campus community for all. So I want to reiterate my thanks and appreciation to the Title IX office. No other office in the university is scrutinized in the same way. These are dedicated employees who have devoted their careers to bettering this space. And let's always remember that, that there's a human element to this work. And while we aren't perfect—and no one is—we have a great and hardworking team who are bettering our campus culture and deserve our thanks.

Now, on a final note, and if you allow me to change subject for just a moment, I'd like to mention that we've already received over 1000 responses in the caregiving survey in only one week. The survey will remain open until October 17. I want you to remind your colleagues to participate and you'll hear more about this later in today's agenda. And I'll conclude my remarks there. And thank you.

Provost Teresa K. Woodruff

Provost Woodruff gave the following remarks:

I want to begin by reiterating that the educational continuity of the university remains my top priority and focus. And that is unwavering. Through the many happenings of the last several weeks, I'm confident that this body is aware of my commitment to openness, as appropriate on behalf of the persons affected and associated processes, and to vigorously defend the rights of our faculty and academic staff and their work. Moreover, I adhere to a process of equity, where no single person—regardless of position, power dynamic, or privilege—is given special treatment. There is conflation by some around a desire to improve our processes and a view that there is a wrong enacted against a former leader. We are all committed to the improvement of our processes. We all deserve clear and consistent ways in which our work is managed. Selectively choosing one individual case to be defended with university funds for no reason other than a broad concern with Title IX—which the index case is neither in dispute nor the sole reason for removal—is not in the interest of the university nor the professed process. Ensuring the safety, creating a culture of belonging, trust, and confidence in processes and leadership by our campus community is part of the work necessary to enable educational continuity.

On that note, I would like to share some exciting news and updates that have taken place since the last time we met. There have been two recent ribbon cuttings since the last time we met. Last Thursday we officially introduced a new $4 million one-story William A. Demmer Engineering Center during a ribbon cutting ceremony. This 10,000-square-foot facility near the corner of Farm Lane and Mount Hope roads will provide an on-campus space for registered student organizations in the College of Engineering, with expansive gathering place for generations of students to engage in enriching, hands-on learning experiences in support of their academic success. And last Friday, we celebrated the opening of our new 7-acre Spartan Greens, artificial turf fields, located on Service Road near the MSU Clinical Center.

Spartan Greens are expected to support more than 8,500 students each semester. Through a mixture of intermural and club sports including lacrosse, soccer, flag football, and others. Student health and wellbeing play critical roles in supporting student success. And to fully support student success, we need to attend to the whole student-- All aspects of student's wellbeing. And these turf fields will play an important role in supporting the health and wellbeing of our students, which in turn supports their overall success. And just yesterday we celebrated a $5.5 million gift commitment from the MSU Federal Credit Union that will advance three MSU art programs over five years and bolster the university's art strategy. The new art strategy will connect the campus and communities with creativity and exploration through three pillars. This gift comes at a great time of great momentum for the university. It will help elevate the arts as an essential element of the MSU experience and amplify recognition of the arts as irreplaceable instruments of knowledge embedding them in the university's academic mission.

This fall, we welcomed over 11,000 new undergraduates, the largest number of new undergraduates to dates and that includes 5,750 women and 2,794 students of color. I note, as has John Ambrose our director of admissions, that the numbers of students identifying as two or more races has increased in our entering class and our Black student population has dropped. This is true nationally and a matter that we are working to correct. The full weight of the Office of the Provost, the Office of the Associate Provost for Enrollment Management and our College of Education and Honors College, as well as all of our deans are being brought to bear on this opportunity gap. One concrete next step is our work on those who deposit and those who matriculate at quarter semester. Ensuring that everyone who is accepted, and initially wants to be a Spartan can be a Spartan is important work and especially true for our Black and African American studies.

I also want to report on some exemplars of excellence. U.S. News & World Report continues to rank several MSU programs at the top in the nation with its release of the 2023 edition of Best Colleges. Importantly—and we're celebrating—MSU's overall rank improved six places from last year, tied for now, number 77. We also moved up two places among public universities-- Now to a tie for 31. We have a number of top 25 programs and I'll just note the number one: supply chain management; number five: productions/operations; and number six: biosystems engineering. The university's favorability ranking, and several student engagement categories also increased in this report. MSU's learning communities—our residential colleges—are ranked four overall and number one among all public universities. We're ranked number two in world education by the Shanghai Global Ranking of Academic Subjects. And number three in the world in communications. MSU has earned global accolades in the Times Higher Education in this year's impact rankings, which measures 1,400 universities and how we're making progress toward the United Nations' sustainable development goals. We are number one in the U.S. for sustainability development goal two, "zero hunger." We are number four in the U.S. for "Sustainable Cities and Communities." We are number one in the U.S. for "Partnerships for the Goals." We are number one in the U.S. for "No Poverty." While we are happy, we are not satisfied. But let us at least feel the confidence of the work that we do that is ranked as excellent. And let us identify those best practices that we do and provide them to others around the country. We can make ourselves better, and as we do so, let us bring others along with us.

Finally, the Kellogg Biological Station—which I just visited last Thursday—received the 2022 Advancing Equity Award, which recognizes unique activities, programs, and approaches that increase the involvement, engagement, and sustainability of underrepresented groups in field science. This is ranked number one out of a total of 170 biological stations around the globe. The educational activities and aspirations of the university continue, with all of us working together to make that happen. I appreciate your continued commitment to academic excellence and student success. MSU is rising, but MSU's work is not done. We know that. We are working . And together we will create a MSU that has equity and safety for all.

Executive Vice President for Health Sciences Norman J. Beauchamp Jr.

EVPHS Beauchamp gave the following remarks:

Thank you, Chairperson Kelly-Blake. We find ourselves in a disheartening place again, and this is particularly disheartening in light of the progress that's been made over the last three years under this president and this provost. Do we have further to go? Yes. But great progress is undeniable. My inclination is always towards processes that heal those that lead to greater soundness or health. And it is my experience that on the most effective path, the healing is paved by seeking to understand those with whom we disagree, not depress on being understood. However, there are moments when there is such a degree of misunderstanding or misinterpretation, such an inability to converge that an alternative approach is in order. This is particularly true in our current circumstance where the misunderstandings and misinterpretations are so fundamental to who we are in the work that must be done.

Authority, responsibility, performance, and accountability. In this instance leading with communicating that which must be understood, what is to be expected, is foundational to moving forward. Thank you all for communicating what must be understood and is expected. My belief is that this is a step toward understanding and ultimately returning us to being the healthy organization that we need to be girded by a shared understanding. My ask is that through this process we be vigilant in supporting those that have dedicated themselves to this institution and finding this moment of regression to feel particularly disheartened. There is much to celebrate for these moments don't define us, but they do threaten us. So let me not take from the time needed to attain necessary clarity and understanding. And I look forward to sharing some of the progress across OHS [Office of Health Sciences] at a future meeting. Thank you.

Faculty Senate Chairperson Karen Kelly-Blake

Chairperson Karen Kelly-Blake gave the following remarks:

Thank you, EVP Beauchamp. So again, good afternoon everyone. First, a reminder to encourage students to vote-- The election is November 8. That's just around the corner. The co-directors of votes@msuvote.msu.edu, Renee Brown and Suchitra (Sue) Webster—forgive me, Dr. Webster—have compiled great resources that can be used in class, and program activities, and at campus events. Please utilize and widely share these resources. We are fortunate to have a satellite East Lansing City Clerk Office located on campus for a whole month, which began yesterday on Monday, October 10, and goes through to Election Day November 8. Students, faculty and staff, please be aware of this unique and convenient option. Again, MSUvote.msu.edu for all things voting and remember to vote yourselves.

Second, thank you to Jo Kovach and Aaron Iturralde for your bold and courageous leadership. On Thursday, October 6, the Associated Students of Michigan State University unanimously passed a vote of no confidence for the Board of Trustees. Their example of standing amid the storm evokes awe and admiration. Thank you, ASMSU.

Lastly, and along that same vein, we are experiencing events that are distracting, frustrating, disappointing, and wildly chaotic. But we have important work to do. And that work is to focus on educational continuity, which has been the rallying call of the provost. You are all probably asking yourselves, "Where is the light at the end of this tunnel?" The light is us. We must stay the course, not be deterred, and we must stand amid the storm. We must be willing to stand with our courageous and awe-inspiring students to demand that those elected-- Elected to work for the good of this university, and successfully achieve its institutional mission, will do their job, and their job alone. If they fail, then we must hold them accountable. If we fail, then the gross overreach, the encroachment, and the boundary crossing will expand further and deeper into the belly of this university. Dare I say, curriculum, teaching, RPT, research, library content, and so on. I have said it before, and it bears repeating here. This moment feels as if we are fighting for the soul of the academy, and we may very well be in just that fight. Thank you all for your work in academic governance.

University Committee on Curriculum Report

University Committee on Curriculum Chairperson Alison Dobbins gave a report on behalf of UCC. The committee approved 29 program changes, as well as 25 new courses, 70 course changes, and one moratorium.

Caregiving Update

Director of the Office of Faculty and Academic Staff Affairs Kara Yermak gave the following report:

In 2022, President Stanley charged a cross-functional Caregiving Work Group to develop recommendations for a university-wide caregiver program that prioritizes support for faculty, academic staff, and support staff and that would make MSU a leading employer in the area of caregiving. This charge was made to advance MSU’s 2030 Strategic Plan, particularly Objective 2, which focuses on staff and faculty Success.

The cross-functional work group actively engaged in this work, and we express appreciation for their efforts and though about this important topic. Their recommendations, completed in the spring, emphasized 1) increasing awareness of the need for caregiving support and knowledge of the information and resources available; 2) funding caregiving resources, and 3) revising relevant policies. The report also provided suggestions to enhance collaboration and sustainability as well as to make MSU an employer of choice in regard to caregiving issues.

  Some initiatives that respond to the recommendations are already underway through collaborations among the [WorkLife Office](https://worklife.msu.edu/news/support-spartans-who-are-caregivers-september-2022), Human Resources, Faculty and Academic Staff Affairs, and academic governance. Examples include [subsidized care options](https://worklife.msu.edu/news/dependent-care-support-available) available to address particular needs, which are managed through MSU’s WorkLife Office. Also, efforts are currently underway through collaboration between the Office of Faculty and Academic Staff Affairs and academic governance to review and advance bereavement and sick leave policies that are responsive to the needs of our diverse faculty and academic staff.

  Also, a survey has been sent to the university community to invite input and feedback that will help prioritize the recommendations of the work group. As of yesterday, 1,100 responses have been submitted. Responses are welcome through October 17, and we encourage wide participation. The results will be summarized and shared with academic governance and the Board of Trustees. Results will guide implementation efforts to advance MSU’s approach to supporting the caregiving responsibilities within our university community.

 Advancing a university-wide caregiving program is a strong institutional-level priority. Christina Brogdon, vice president for human resources, and Ann Austin, interim associate provost and associate vice president for faculty and academic staff affairs, co-lead planning for next steps. Questions and ideas should be directed to them.

Title IX and Relationship Violence and Sexual Misconduct at MSU

Presidential Advisors on RVSM Rebecca Campbell and Detective Lt. Andrea Munford gave a presentation on the major initiatives the university has enacted in recent years. The overview focused on the university’s response to the 2019 *Know More* survey results and the Nassar case. The university’s work revolved around three main focus areas, improvement of RVSM services, increased prevention, implementation of policy and culture changes, and improvement of Title IX investigations.

Some initiatives that have been implemented with the goal of improving campus services include increased staffing levels at the center for survivors, the creation of the sexual assault healthcare program, the creation of the Sexual Assault Response Team, and piloting a 24-hour residence hall advocacy response program.

A strong focus on prevention was also discussed. Initiatives included increasing staffing levels to support faculty and staff training, creating the climate and response unit, and creating the Student Voice for Prevention Initiative.

Updating policies and changing university culture was also a focus of university initiatives. The university joined the National Academy of Sciences’ Action Collaborative on Preventing Sexual Harassment in Higher Education. The university updated its policies on Title IX. It also updated the emeritum policy, the faculty handbook, and the faculty discipline and dismissal for cause policy to allow revocations of emeritum status and faculty honors in cases of RVSM violations. Additional staff has also been added to the Office of Institutional Equity and the Office for Civil Rights and Title IX Education and Compliance .

Title IX Certification Process

Vice President of Legal Affairs and General Counsel Brian Quinn gave an overview of the Title IX certification process and its history. The certification process was established by both federal and state law and require the president and a member of the Board of Trustees to annually certify that they received and reviewed employee RVSM reports. General Counsel Quinn also explained the state boilerplate certification process and timeline.

Acceptable Engagement of the Board of Trustees when Reviewing Administrative Decisions

Chairperson Kelly-Blake discussed her concern “about the board’s overreach into academic management matters, particularly involving personnel decisions, which are entirely the purview of the provost of this university.” University Committee on Academic Governance Chairperson Jack Lipton presented an overview of recent university events and relevant policies including the MSU Board of Trustees Code of Ethics and Conduct. Vice Chairperson Stephanie Anthony moved to adopt the following resolution:

*Whereas,* Members of the Board of Trustees have continued to destabilize the university since the Faculty Senate expressed its concern[[1]](#footnote-2) on September 13; and

*Whereas,* The Associated Students of Michigan State University voted no confidence in the Board of Trustees on October 6 by a vote of 21–0 (with four abstentions)[[2]](#footnote-3) in response; therefore be it,

*Resolved,*The Faculty Senate has no confidence in the Michigan State University Board of Trustees.

 Following discussion, the resolution was adopted by a vote of 55 to 4.

Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 4:39 p.m.



\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Tyler Silvestri
Secretary for Academic Governance

Approved: November 15, 2022

| **Attendance** |
| --- |
| **Present** | 55 |
| **Absent** | 15 |
| **Total** | 70 |
| **Quorum** | 36 |

| **Constituency/Title** | **Name**  | **Attendance** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Academic Specialists | Megan Stevenson | Present |
| Agriculture and Natural Resources | Cimberly Weir | Present |
| Agriculture and Natural Resources | Satish Joshi | Present |
| Agriculture and Natural Resources | Dale Rozeboom | Absent |
| Agriculture and Natural Resources | Lorraine Weatherspoon | Absent |
| Agriculture and Natural Resources | Sinem Mollaoglu | Present |
| Arts and Letters | Brahim Chakrani | Present |
| Arts and Letters | Danielle DeVoss | Present |
| Arts and Letters | Karthik Durvasula | Present |
| Arts and Letters | Kate Birdsall | Present |
| Arts and Letters | Yore Kedem | Present |
| At Large | d’Ann de Simone | Present |
| At Large | Megan Donahue | Present |
| At Large | Rebecca Malouin | Present |
| At Large, Chairperson | Karen Kelly-Blake | Present |
| At Large, Vice Chairperson | Stephanie Anthony | Present |
| Business | Ayalla Ruvio | Substituted: Anita Pansari |
| Business | John Spink | Present |
| Business | Quan Zhang | Present |
| Communication Arts and Sciences | Dan Hiaeshutter-Rice | Present |
| Communication Arts and Sciences | Rabindra "Robby" Ratan | Present |
| Communication Arts and Sciences | Lucinda Davenport | Absent |
| Education | Matthew Brodhead | Substituted: Avner Segall |
| Education | Amelia Gotwals | Present |
| Education | Emre Umucu | Absent |
| Emeriti Faculty | Gary Stone | Absent |
| Engineering | Chengcheng Fang | Present |
| Engineering | Mark Worden | Present |
| Engineering | Neil Wright | Present |
| Engineering | Wei Liao | Absent |
| FRIB | Chris Wrede | Present |
| Human Medicine | Cristian Meghea | Substituted: Hannah Bolder |
| Human Medicine | Amber Heard-Booth | Present |
| Human Medicine | Hua Xiao | Present |
| Human Medicine | Michael Williams | Present |
| Human Medicine | Scott Counts | Absent |
| James Madison | Daniel Ahlquist | Present |
| James Madison | Daniel Kramer | Present |
| Law | Jennifer Carter-Johnson | Present |
| Law | Wenona Singel | Present |
| Libraries | Lisa Robinson | Present |
| Libraries | Rick Stoddart | Present |
| Libraries | Alexandra Hauser | Absent |
| Lyman Briggs | Samantha Cass | Present |
| Lyman Briggs | Richard Bellon | Absent |
| Music | Guy Yehuda | Present |
| Music | Sarah Long | Absent |
| Natural Science | Aaron Odom | Present |
| Natural Science | Francois Greer | Present |
| Natural Science | Min-Hao Kuo | Present |
| Natural Science | Thomas Hamann | Present |
| Nursing | Gayle Lourens | Absent |
| Osteopathic Medicine | Jacek Cholewicki | Present |
| Osteopathic Medicine | Jason Bazil | Present |
| Osteopathic Medicine | Erik Shapiro | Absent |
| Osteopathic Medicine | Kin Sing Lee | Absent |
| RCAH | Eric Aronoff | Present |
| RCAH | India Plough | Present |
| Social Science | Laurie Bulock | Present |
| Social Science | Peilei Fan | Present |
| Social Science | Pilar Horner | Present |
| Social Science | Raymond Jussaume | Present |
| UCAG | Jack Lipton | Present |
| UCC | Alison Dobbins | Present |
| UCFA | Jamie Alan | Present |
| UCFT | Susan Barman | Present |
| UCGS | Gary Hoppenstand | Substituted: Anne-Lise Halvorsen |
| UCUE | Antoinette Tessmer | Present |
| Veterinary Medicine | Sean Crosson | Present |
| Veterinary Medicine | Stephan Carey | Absent |

1. [Original Citation] *See* Michigan State University Faculty Senate, Resolution FS2223R01, September 13, 2022 ([https://acadgov.msu.edu/-/media/assets/academicgovernance/docs/faculty-senate/2022-2023/fsresolutions/fs2223r01.pdf](https://acadgov.msu.edu/-/media/assets/academicgovernance/docs/faculty-senate/2022-2023/fsresolutions/fs2223r01.pdf?rev=19d5c848e34f4d59873ec3bea1800e6f&hash=3EBACB641ED2A941A09160C65E6CF361)) and Faculty Senate Resolution FS2223R02, September 13, 2022 ([https://acadgov.msu.edu/-/media/assets/academicgovernance/docs/faculty-senate/2022-2023/fsresolutions/fs2223r02.pdf](https://acadgov.msu.edu/-/media/assets/academicgovernance/docs/faculty-senate/2022-2023/fsresolutions/fs2223r02.pdf?rev=fc6a746c6be44359b3290e90bb5e92fc&hash=1421E84969756CB61C8B74C4188BB856)).
 [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
2. [Original Citation] *See* Associated Students of Michigan State University, Bill 59-21: No Confidence in the Board of Trustees, October 6, 2022 (<https://acadgov.msu.edu/-/media/assets/academicgovernance/docs/faculty-senate/2022-2023/fs-2022-10-11/asmsu-resolution-59-21-no-confidence-in-board-of-trustees.pdf>). [↑](#footnote-ref-3)